E-GOVERNMENT AS A FORM OF SMART GOVERNANCE IMPLEMENTATION AT BANDUNG SMART CITY

Arjuna Arief Kesuma[1*], Arief Sukma Yulianto[2], Sapta Dwi P[3]

Universitas Indonesia Depok, Indonesia

Email : Arjunaariefkesuma13@gmail.com[1*], arief.tkd29@gmail.com[2], Saptadp7@gmail.com[3]

*Correspondence

ABSTRACT

Keywords: E-Government; Innovative Governance; Bandung Smart City.

Innovative steps in achieving total realization of E-Government are not only carried out through the birth of ideas and joint agreements between government institutions in the city of Bandung. The government must also pay careful attention to the factors underlying the government's actions. In addition to fulfilling information technology-based digital services, the government must also be able to predict what will create a gap between community needs and the reality that occurs while implementing the E-Government Bandung Smart City program. Through a literature study approach, this research focuses on developing theory and by collecting secondary data, the research results show that the Bandung City Government continues to strive to optimize E-Government by strengthening regulations and continuous evaluation, which will ultimately optimize the accountability of information technology-based public services in every area in the city of Bandung and also maximizing the application of the Bandung Smart City concept by minimizing community disparities in each region in the city and implementing the Bandung Smart City concept by minimizing community disparities in each city region. This article explains the e-government situation in Bandung Smart City and provides examples of the positive impacts of implementing the bright city concept. This research has implications for becoming a reference in implementing the Smart City concept in all regions in Indonesia.

Introduction

Advances in information and communication technology can be a tool to improve government efficiency. In government, e-government uses new technologies and systems (Sholeh et al., 2019). The definition in general, E-Government is the application of Government Information Technology (ICT) to improve government functions and services; it goes hand in hand with the development of technology utilization in the current global era, in line with the (Mukhsin, 2020) explanation that the era of globalization brings a new current of change and paradigm related to what happens in the development of the community environment and how the government responds by changing working papers, and other manual methods that are still traditional (Mayowan, 2016). E-Government will be integral to the government's efforts to improve bureaucratic efficiency. Many benefits can be obtained through online networks and integrated frameworks in implementing e-government (Saifuddin, 2020). With information systems and modern technology, e-government is expected to answer the challenges of government management information needs, provide improved administrative processes,

and ensure the quality of public accountability (Nurdin, 2018). A continuous decision-making process and adequate and well-structured knowledge will also enable government agencies to carry out their duties efficiently and accurately (Utama, 2020) against the backdrop of increasing public demands for greater transparency and accountability of the public sector worldwide, including in Indonesia. Centralization of authority of public engagement and barriers to public participation are barriers to public and private openness and accountability. For the city of Bandung, the massive implementation of e-government began with the encouragement of Bandung City to become a Smart City in the government of Ridwan Kamil in 2013; the Smart City concept is encouraged to develop the city, in the intelligent city concept itself there are several pillars, namely, innovative governance, intelligent people, smart economy, smart living, innovative environment.

The need for the pillar of innovative governance is implementing electronic government to implement innovative governance. The concept of e-government is based on the enthusiasm of the public, who want easy access to information and services that are permanent and sustainable (Baker, 2016). It also stated that E-Government is a governance system of government services that seeks to align innovative adoption to transform with the times. E-government-oriented activities are generally expected to have factual implications for government organizations, the business world, and society. Another definition suggests that e-government is also a forum for involvement in the use of information and communication technology to provide access to all community needs within an unlimited period of access. (Stockemer, 2019) also defines several principles closely related to e-government: (1) Government services must be pro-community; in their application, a service provided by the government to the community must be oriented to ease of access, adaptiveness, and responsiveness to governance. (2) Information management must be rational and readily accepted by the public so that the provision of information carried out by the government becomes valuable information for the community's needs. (3) All information and government service sites must have easy access and be well integrated electronically, both from computers and mobile phones, so that people do not struggle and have difficulties when they need access provided by the government. (4) Access to Government Services must have flexibility and be inclusive; with other definitions, electronic services must undergo improvements and improvements in the rapid development of technology and the demands of information access needs from the public. According to Indrajit (2006: 8), The existence of the E-Government Mechanism is an early departure from a renewal of service governance between the involvement of the government, the community, and other stakeholders oriented toward optimizing the use of information technology to maximize the quality of public service implementation.

Smart Governance can contribute from the public service and administrative sides, such as in the decision-making process in producing public and social services and facilities and infrastructure in producing online services.

Smart Governance is one of the foundations of the intelligent city concept. Besides being the central pillar, Smart governance is also closely related to overall governance,

which is oriented towards collaboration between institutions to jointly realize the effectiveness and efficiency of implementing the bright city concept (Ruijer et al., 2023). Collaboration from various parties, both government, private, and community elements in Collaborative Governance, is also intended to accommodate the escalation of community demands, which are increasing daily, especially in developing infrastructure or public goods aimed at public administration. This is also in line with what Agranoff stated: several factors that cause the collaboration system to stick between groups include the interdependence of resources between management and the implementation of collaboration. Several key elements of intelligent governance: The first element is the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT), which, in implementing innovative governance, must provide new communication channels for accessibility for citizens, such as e-government and e-democracy. The second element is external collaboration and participation. Innovative governance means collaboration between various departments and society to build growth and produce community-centered public services. The third element is internal coordination. This element talks about how communication can work to produce collaboration in carrying out innovative governance. The fourth element of Smart Governance is the decision-making process. This element explains that innovative governance is divided into three steps in decision-making: first, by diagnosing public needs, then developing strategic plans through evaluation, and by taking action on the accuracy of public issues. The fifth determining element is e-administration. Innovative governance refers to the ability to interact with society online, both in the form of public services. The sixth and final determining element is the results. Innovative governance aims to achieve the goal of meeting the needs of urban residents in public services.

Through Presidential Instruction Number 3 of 2003, the Indonesian Government plans to implement e-Government. This e-government application will better handle all aspects of government, not only the Central Government in Jakarta but also regional and provincial offices.

Bandung is implementing the Smart City concept based on many urban problems, such as high population growth and heavy traffic, because Bandung City is the capital of West Java Province and has the title of second most populous after DKI Jakarta. This density level is undoubtedly a challenge for the Bandung City Government regarding population. The large population implements public services complicated. This is done by utilizing Information and Communication Technology (ICT) to create an integrated governance system. In implementing the Bright City concept, Bandung started in 2014 and has received many achievements and awards, such as in 2017. The Bandung City Government received the Smart City Readiness award in 2017. In the same year, the Bandung City Government was also awarded the Smart City Rating 2017 (RKCI) category, which received appreciation from the Smart Indonesia Initiative Association (APIC) ITB. This award was given in appreciation for the Bandung City Government's consistency in implementing the bright city concept, and most recently, in 2022, it

received an award from the Ministry of Communication and Information for the best implementation of innovative governance. This article will focus on analyzing E-Government as a form of implementing innovative governance in Bandung Smart City: This article will explain how e-government as a form of implementing innovative governance can run well in the city of Bandung. The significance of this article is that it can help explain the implementation of intelligent governance. It can be a model for encouraging other regions to follow the implementation of e-government in Bandung Smart City.

Research Methods

This research uses a literature study exploring several studies on implementing intelligent governance. This type of research uses literature study. This method has activities that correlate with data collection, recording, reading, and processing of what will become research material (Broccardo et al., 2019). A literature review is a mandatory activity in research, especially academic research, with the main aim of developing theoretical and practical application aspects. Each researcher carries out literature studies to find a basis for collecting and building a theoretical basis and reflection framework and identifying temporary hypotheses, also called research hypotheses. By conducting literature studies, researchers have a broader and deeper understanding of the problems they want to research. A thorough literature review can help establish a foundation for current research based on previous research (Stockemer, 2019). By conducting several systematic reviews from previous journals and literacy, the literature study method can also analyze literacy updates relevant to the research topic. (Bolívar & Meijer, 2016) It also suggests that the Literature Study explores a complete literature review with in-depth topic coverage; literature searches and re-research are indispensable process elements in reviewing explicit inclusion and exclusion criteria to ensure relevance to the study and selection of research topics. This research literature study will review several previous studies and journals to analyze the relevance of changes to research developments and problems with current analysis. This is in line with what was stated by (Snyder, 2019) that literature studies have an essential role as a basis for developing knowledge, policy making, implementation, and providing an overview of the impact of research results. The first research used as a literature study is an article entitled "Implementation Of Smart City In Bandung City In Realizing The Concept Of Smart Governance." In this article, the implementation of Bandung Smart City, including the intelligent governance dimension, has been carried out since 2013, following the master plan, which was planned two times during the development period. This research focuses on intelligent cities, which provide ICT, IoT, sensors, etc., to help implement governance—competent government in Bandung. The novelty of this research is that it is more focused on analyzing the E-Government carried out by the Bandung City Government and seeing the achievements and evaluations for the running of Bandung Smart City. The second research is entitled "Smart Governance: Using a Literature Review and Empirical Analysis to Build a Research Model." This article is used to explain related elements.

Results and Discussion
Implementation of E-Government in Bandung Smart City

As defined in public services, which has been stated in Law No. 25 of 2009 article 1, paragraph 1, the scope of public services includes a series of activities aimed at meeting the needs of each citizen by the needs of services and laws and regulations that include aspects of goods, services or administrative fulfillment of services available by public agencies as well as acting as public service providers. Furthermore, since the enactment of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, it has caused a desire for all regions to compete to improve maximum performance in government administration. The site or web is the embodiment of the e-government system. The conception of E-government not only focuses on aspects of technological sophistication and financing efficiency but also prioritizes the reflection of good governance, such as transparency, public openness, precise policy direction, improving the quality of public services, and maximizing active community involvement (Silvia & Purnaweni, 2023). The city of Bandung itself has held e-government since 2001 through the www.bandung.go.id website. However, at that time, the Bandung city website only contained information about activities carried out by the Bandung city government, such as services in the city of Bandung, work activities, announcements concerning the scope of the Bandung city government, and other things about information about events or activities held in the city of Bandung.

However, since the Bandung City Government led by Ridwan Kamil, Bandung City has transformed into a smart city, commonly called a smart city. The intelligent government e-book by (Negara et al., 2021) states that the current development for smart cities or smart cities is proliferating. This is a matter of using electronic devices and forming a system and its settings. The bright city concept in this book is considered to create more effective and efficient human resource management. The purpose of a smart city is to connect the government, which has been considered to have a long and rigid bureaucracy, to be more agile and interconnected with relevant stakeholders. So, it will have implications, namely, the effective exchange of information in real-time. In addition, it is also expected that this smart city will improve the economy and social life of the people in Bandung City by involving economic stakeholders and investors to support the development of infrastructure in Bandung City.

The Smart City concept is one of the concepts to create a sustainable city. Sustainability itself is a measurable process, which can be seen from how we implement the efficiency and effectiveness of the sustainable development process, which can be seen in intelligent cities worldwide (Erza et al., 2022). Through the https://smartcity.bandung.go.id page, the Bandung City Government presents various community services facilitated online. Some of these services include online services for taxes, building permits, population management, and outpatient information services for people who need first aid related to health. Online public services carried out by the

Bandung City Government are one of the indicators in the implementation of intelligent governance (Erza, 2015), namely:

"The Smart Government Dimension through 3 Working Areas (Online et al. Government). Where Online Service has two indicators (Online et al. Payments)."

The main thing in online services is using digital technology for the community to be more easily done and accessible. This is equivalent to what is mentioned in RB Regulation Number 26 of 2020 concerning implementing the Electronic-Based Government System (SPBE), one of which is applied to electronic-based public services.

Analysis of 6 elements of Smart Governance (Bolivar, Meijer (2016) in the implementation of E-Government in Bandung Smart City:

The first element is the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT); the Bandung City Government runs e-government by presenting many public service applications/portals, as quoted from the Bandung.go.id website that there are 394 applications to provide convenience and flexibility to provide public services and can be used as a trigger for the performance of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) (https://www.bandung.go.id/news/read/4123/394-aplikasi-untuk-pelayanan-publik-kota-bandung). The use of information and communication technology in Bandung City is carried out with the appointment of open data related to the adjustment of data access needs by the people of Bandung City. Bandung City has implemented an open data system since 2014. Open data access can be displayed in several online features through http://data.bandung.go.id/. The implementation of digitalization and the presence of existing applications shows that the Bandung city government has met the first criterion in using information and communication technology to produce good public services as effectively and efficiently, also, through strengthening by the Minister of Agriculture RB No. 26 of 2020, which examines the implementation of SPBE, measured by the implementation of electronic-based public services.

The second element is internal coordination. Initially, Bandung City itself has been organizing e-government since 2001 through www.bandung.go.id website. However, that year, the website only contained related information about the activities carried out by the Bandung city government; there were no direct services the public could access. Furthermore, a discourse was carried out for the implementation of this Smart City concept in the era led by Ridwan Kamil, with the establishment of the Smart City Development Council in 2014 through Bandung Mayor Decree Number 130 / Kep.860-Bappeda / 2014 concerning the Bandung Smart City Development Council. The council aims to illustrate the big concept of a smart city in Bandung. To encourage digitalization and the implementation of e-government, the Bandung City Government collaborates with relevant stakeholders to encourage intelligent city implementation and produce a Bandung Smart City Master Plan.

The third element is collaboration and external participation; collaboration between the Bandung City Government and the Bandung City Development Council resulted in the Bandung Smart City master plan. In public policy literacy, policy guidelines or reference documents in the form of blueprints are essential in policy implementation.

Ideally, before implementing a policy, it must first have a clear basis or direction so that its implementation can be carried out by what has been planned. Bandung City took steps to implement the bright city concept by preparing a more technology-oriented foundation, infrastructure, and training equipment. Furthermore, the Bandung City Government cooperates with external (private) parties to provide fiber optic lines and internet bandwidth so that all regional equipment offices and city government CCTV cameras are connected to the network. Then, in collaboration with IBM Indonesia, IBM Indonesia is a branch or division of the multinational technology company IBM (International et al. Corporation) operating in Indonesia. IBM is one of the world's leading technology companies, providing a wide range of solutions and services in information technology, including cloud computing, artificial intelligence, data analytics, information security, etc.

The fourth element of innovative governance is the decision-making process. The application of E-Government in electronic administrative services gives the government data related to public participation in accessing public services so that it can be helpful in the decision-making process based on verifiable evidence and facts. On the Bandung Sadayana website, there is a BADAMI (Bandung et al.) feature as a digital channel to facilitate the discussion forum of the people of Bandung City to increase empowerment in the development of Bandung City. Then the LAPOR application has also been provided by the Bandung City Government, which aims to create digital facilities for the people of Bandung City to participate in providing suggestions and criticisms if they find the public service process that is not by procedures. So, the practice of e-government tini reduces the potential for decision-making that is speculative or based on subjective perceptions; it can also encourage greater transparency in the decision-making process. It also allows the government to account for its decisions.

The fifth element is e-administration; this element emphasizes that innovative governance is based on the ability of government institutions to communicate digitally in an integrated manner with the public to facilitate public services and fulfill predetermined mandates. Digitalization in conducting public services of the Bandung City Government Until now, there are nine government administration service applications, 18 public service applications, four special service applications (certain situations), and 263 OPD (Regional Equipment Organization) service applications (Kurnia, 2023), the Bandung City Government runs the following e-administration:

1. BCC (Bandung Command Center) is a control room launched in 2015; the function of this BCC is to monitor the situation of Bandung because BCC is connected to CCTV in the corners of the city.
2. Done In Grip (Salaman) is an application initiated by disdukcapil Kota Bandung. This application aims to improve the ease of service-oriented towards transparency, efficiency, and effectiveness to meet the needs of community services in making and submitting population documents that do not have time constraints.

3. Pay PBB Using QRIS, one of the innovative steps in QRIS payments and provides effectiveness in the transaction process, is also believed to increase revenue and maximize transparency.

4. Electronic Self-Assessment Tax Reporting Application (E-Satria). This application aims to optimize the taxpayer program in Bandung City for access to tax reporting. With the E-Satria application, tax payments are expected to be more transparent and avoid service irregularities such as fungi and bureaucratic abuse.

5. SP4N - REPORT! This application is intended as a forum for conveying public aspirations and also to facilitate public complaints against irregularities in public services carried out by the Government, which are available from various channels both via SMS, Twitter, and Smartphones

6. New BIMMA (Bandung Integrated Manpower Management Application) Through the development carried out by the Bandung city directorate, the New BIMMA application is aimed at reducing unemployment in the city of Bandung with various features such as training, internship programs, and information on job openings, this application is also expected to increase public participation with easy access after application development.

7. UHC (Universal et al.) is a health service-based application system provided by the Bandung city government to facilitate and provide guarantees to the community to get a healthy livability

8. E-Skm is an application that provides information related to service quality indicators from the Community Satisfaction Survey, where Government Agencies, through service units, periodically produce information related to Community Satisfaction surveys. The existence of this application is expected to represent the quality of service in several government agencies for services that have been provided to the community in an integrated manner

9. Through this application, the community gets easy access to digitally integrated services with a one-stop system for the services needed. Bandung Sadayana is the parent of digital services provided by the Bandung City Government (https://www.bandung.go.id/news/read/7384/bandung-conecticity-digitalisasi-ciptakan-layanan-publik-akuntabel-da).

The sixth and last element is the result of all elements carried out, that the City of Bandung has implemented innovative governance in the implementation of E-Government. Digital technology is beneficial for the government to provide public services online and is more easily accessible to the public without the need to come to government offices. From the ease of getting public services, the Bandung city government still has a way to get feedback through surveys of the level of public satisfaction in getting public services. Government agencies, through service units, periodically produce information related to community satisfaction surveys. This application is expected to represent the quality of service in several government agencies for services provided to the community in an integrated manner—the data on the same. Bandung.go.id website shows that in 2022, the quality of Bandung city government

services received an excellent prediction (B) from a community survey. Furthermore, the results of intelligent governance by the Bandung City Government can increase community participation. This is done by optimizing community empowerment in participating in improving development and access to governance, which can be accessed through the BADAMI (Bandung et al.) feature and the LAPOR application feature, which functions for input and evaluation materials to improve public services to the community.

Evaluation of E-Government Implementation in Bandung Smart City

The implementation of the Bandung City digitalization policy has been listed in Government Regulation Number 38 of 2017. However, the regulation has not been fully spread evenly in each region in the city of Bandung, based on the results of the Bandung regional institutional readiness analysis, which notes the unavailability of regional smart city SOP guidebooks that will later become an essential reference in each region to represent the Bandung city government's digitalization policy. (Soleh, et.al., 2019) It also explained that priority problems in Bandung must be carried out effectively and efficiently, and special attention must be paid to understanding the community's apparatus, regulations, and needs. This factor, of course, must also involve participation from the community in the aspects of the Environment, Infrastructure, and City spatial management.

Several weaknesses have also been analyzed in the strategic analysis of the Bandung Smart City Masterplan book, one of which is accountability in the E-Budgeting program. The public can undoubtedly see various information through the website page http://musrenbang.bandung.go.id/login. However, the website has not been integrated with access points through https://bandung.go.id/ and auction information for the procurement of goods and services through https://birms.bandung.go.id/, so in the aspect of transparency and Accountability of access to information data related to the implementation of budgeting cannot be seen by the public, this is also because there is no particular application that can facilitate. In addition to the inability of public access, in looking at the implementation of budgeting, the lack of transparency aspects also focuses on the limited access to public information on procurement activities for goods and services and the absence of detailed information related to why and how an organization or institution can win the auction process, in the evaluation that the Government has not optimized the social community to jointly strengthen the implementation of digitalization (E-Government) as a whole in the city of Bandung, and to answer these obstacles, the Bandung City government will increase the empowerment of all potential academics and social communities to integrate systems and data jointly.

In the results of the report outlined in the 2018-2023 Bandung City RPJMD, there are still several problems in communications and informatics matters; some of the problems include:

1. application development and integration are not running optimally, with 289 applications. However, only nine applications have been integrated with the Diskominfo server, so this is still an essential reference for facing future challenges to optimize so that all applications can be integrated so that they can improve the

effectiveness of government governance and can immediately move towards bright city level "wise:

2. There is minimal involvement/empowerment of universities and ICT volunteers because, up to now, there are only 16 people involved, both from universities and ICT volunteers. Moreover, ideally, there should be one ICT volunteer in one sub-district.

3. At the level of intelligent city feasibility in Bandung, based on survey results from the collaboration between the RKCI team and ITB in 2017, it is in the integrative category with a value of 60.80%. The remaining achievements need to be increased to the intelligence level. Information and Communication Technology (ICT) has become something that cannot be separated because it is closely related to all aspects of human life.

This is to the objectives of the ICT aspect, which can increase effectiveness, efficiency, transparency, and accountability in several activities. Several public service information systems are built on the Internet through a data-based Internet network, such as E-Gov, E-Health, and E-Learning. However, the achievements from using ICT have not been fully optimal. The cause of one of these things is that databases and applications are built using different data platforms and information systems. This results in databases and information systems being unable to be integrated reliably to provide an integrated activity service.

Conclusion

The transformation of Bandung City into an intelligent city shows the importance of innovation and transformation in the application of e-government and open data in presenting public services. Technology, digitalization, and online service applications have brought positive changes in providing services to the community. They are starting with the presence of www.bandung.go.id website. In 2001, the Bandung City Government began to implement the concept of e-government by providing information related to the agenda of activities and services in the Bandung City government. Then, with information and communication technology development in 2013, the Bandung City Government, led by Ridwan Kamil, initiated the implementation of the Smart City concept in the City of Bandung. A series of processes, such as establishing the Smart City Development Council in 2014, listed in the Bandung Mayor Decree Number 130 of 2014, related to the Bandung Smart City Development Council. With the involvement of stakeholders, Bandung City has become a city with the best Smart Governance implementation in Indonesia in 2022. E-government practices in Bandung City also follow principles such as the empowerment of ICT that is innovative, open, easy access, responsive, and participatory democratic. Like the presence of the Bandung Sadayana application (All Digital City Services), with the existence of an application, community services can be accessed through an integrated system with one-stop accessibility that can be facilitated.

Bibliography

Baker, J. Don. (2016). The purpose, process, and methods of writing a literature review. *AORN Journal*, *103*(3), 265–269.

Bolívar, Manuel Pedro Rodríguez, & Meijer, Albert J. (2016). Innovative governance: Using a literature review and empirical analysis to build a research model. *Social Science Computer Review*, *34*(6), 673–692.

Broccardo, Laura, Culasso, Francesca, & Mauro, Sara Giovanna. (2019). Innovative city governance: exploring the institutional work of multiple actors towards collaboration. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, *32*(4), 367–387.

Erza, O. (2015). Measuring the Perception of Bandung's Community in Implementing the Smart Environment Concept. *Editorial Team*, p. 58.

Erza, Osni, Suparmoko, M., & Tambunan, Tulus T. H. (2022). Development Of Smart Governance Measurement Framework To Create A Sustainable Bandung Smart City. *Penanomics: International Journal of Economics*, *1*(1), 61–74.

Mayowan, Yuniadi. (2016). Penerapan teknologi informasi dan komunikasi di desa (studi kasus di kabupaten Lamongan). *Profit: Jurnal Administrasi Bisnis*, *10*(1), 14–23.

Mukhsin, Mukhsin. (2020). Peranan teknologi informasi dan komunikasi menerapkan sistem informasi desa dalam publikasi informasi desa di era globalisasi. *Teknokom*, *3*(1), 7–15. https://doi.org/10.31943/teknokom.v3i1.43

Negara, Edi Surya, Hidayanto, Achmad Nizar, Andryani, Ria, & Syaputra, Rezki. (2021). Survey of innovative contract framework and its application. *Information*, *12*(7), 257.

Nurdin, Andi Heny Mulawati. (2018). Menuju pemerintahan terbuka (open government) melalui penerapan e-government. *Jurnal MP (Manajemen Pemerintahan)*, *5*(1), 1–17.

Saifuddin, Ridwan. (2020). Pemanfaatan Teknologi Informasi dalam Peningkatan Pendapatan Asli Daerah. *Inovasi Pembangunan: Jurnal Kelitbangan*, *8*(02), 183. https://doi.org/10.35450/jip.v8i02.198

Sholeh, Chaereyranba, Sintaningrum, Sintaningrum, & Sugandi, Yogi Suprayogi. (2019). Formulation of innovation policy: Case of Bandung smart city. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik*, *22*(3), 173.

Silvia, Maya, & Purnaweni, Hartuti. (2023). Analisis Manajemen Pengaduan Kanal Pengaduan "Sapa Mbak Ita" Kecamatan Tembalang. *Journal of Public Policy and Management Review*, *12*(4), 679–699.

Snyder, Hannah. (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and

guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, *104*, 333–339. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.07.039

Utama, A. A. Gde Satia. (2020). The implementation of e-government in Indonesia. *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science (2147-4478)*, *9*(7), 190–196. https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v9i7.929