

Optimizing Employee Transfer in an Effort to Get Acceptable Employees at the Directorate General of Defense Forces

Cecep Usman Akbar Askanta^{1*}, Fibria Indriati Dwi Liestiwati²

Universitas Indonesia, Indonesia

Email: cecep.usman@ui.ac.id, fibria.idl@ui.ac.id

*Correspondence

ABSTRACT

Keywords: Employee Transfer; Competency; Merit System; Human Resource Management; Public Sector; Transparency; Accountability

This research aims to examine the employee transfer system in order to obtain adequate competence at the Directorate General of Defense Strengthening. The method used is a qualitative approach with literature studies and in-depth interviews with employees within the Directorate General of Customs and Defense. The results of the study show that the current employee transfer process has not adopted the merit system optimally, with the existence of dominant administrative filing and lack of transparency and accountability. In addition, there are shortcomings in the assessment of performance and competencies from previous workplaces, as well as orientation and training programs that have not been fully effective. These findings underscore the importance of reforms in human resource management in the public sector to improve employee competence and performance. It is hoped that the implementation of the merit system, competency-based assessment, and improvement of training programs can overcome existing problems and optimize organizational performance.



Introduction

Employee competence is needed in an organization in dealing with a highly competitive market situation. Where employee competence refers to the traits, skills, or attributes that employees need to do their jobs more effectively (M. A. Campion et al., 2011; Soderquist et al., 2010), competence can also increase a person's value and help predict the success of a job (Flannery et al., 1996). In an organization, having people who have competence will produce a higher quality product (Ahuja & Khamba, 2008), support innovation (Siguaw et al., 2006) and reduce employee turnover costs (Joo & Lim, 2009).

This step must be taken by both private and public sector organizations to face the demands of the strategic environment, such as the development of information and communication technology, globalization and increasing the nation's competitiveness, as well as public expectations for the performance of the central and regional governments that continue to develop, in line with the development and dynamics of society (Sumanti, 2018). So that having a competent number of employees with the required skills, abilities,

knowledge, and experience, to achieve organizational goals is something important (Sarma, 2009), both in the private and public sectors.

In the public sector, the quality of government largely depends on the quality of the people who manage the government (Tjiptoherijanto, 2011), if employees improve the quality, integrity, professionalism and performance of employees in carrying out their duties, of course personnel reform will run (Prasojo, 2010), because if the personnel system is bad, there will be internal problems in the country's civil service system (Prasojo, 2010).

For this reason, in order to get people who have good competence in a public organization with the right strategy to hire competent people through effective human resource management strategies, namely recruitment, transfer/mutation, and selection, so that the goal of selecting the 'right' individuals and rejecting the 'bad' ones is achieved (Bach, 2009), because success in implementing the arrangement of the human resource system can realize a clean bureaucracy, quality public services and increasing accountability for the performance and competence of apparatus resources (Sumanti, 2018),

However, unfortunately, Recruitment, which is a step in the process of finding employees in an organization (Rao, 2009), and is carried out to achieve important public goals and create public value (Johnson et al., 2022), cannot be carried out optimally due to the existence of *a minimum essential forces* (MEF) policy by emphasizing zero growth personnel since 2010 which requires the acceptance of personnel in the same number as personnel quitting (Tempo.co, 2010). In addition, the CPNS moratorium in the organizational restructuring and efficiency of the government employee budget since 2011 through the Joint Regulation on the Temporary Postponement of the Admission of Civil Servant Candidates signed by 3 (three) Ministers, namely the Minister of State for State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform, the Minister of Home Affairs, and the Minister of Finance (Ahdiyana, 2015; Dharmaningtias, 2016; Rakhmawanto, 2011), thus causing the shock of employees who entered the Directorate General of Strength. This can be seen from the results of the employees who entered the Directorate General of Strength from the 2018 to 2023 range of only 5 (five) personnel (simpeg.kemhan.go.id). In fact, during this vulnerable time, the personnel of the Directorate General of Strength experienced employee depreciation due to retirement, moving outside the agency, and passing away. So that it causes shortages in quantity and quality.

This was revealed through three annual reports of the Directorate General of Strength consisting of a work program report, a work program evaluation report, and a performance report of government agencies of the Directorate General of Strength which stated that: (a) there has been a shortage of personnel in the implementation of the duties and functions of the Directorate General of Strength (b) the overall competence of personnel is still lacking in terms of technical and behavior (c) there is a shortage of personnel who should be 468 positions, Only 256 people who hold the position or only 56% are filled (d) vacant positions cannot be filled by existing personnel because they are

not in accordance with their competencies. (e) The shortage of personnel causes an excessive workload on personnel within the Directorate General of Strength. This situation is in line with the BKN report in 2022 which stated that the measurement of the ASN Professionalism Index (IP) from 623 agencies, including 34 Ministries, the results of the measurement or value of ASN IP nationally are 44.60 with a very low category (CNBC, 2022).

This problem causes the Directorate General of Strength to significantly depreciate human resources both in quality and quantity, which hampers organizational performance within the Directorate General of Strength. where an organization should have the right personnel in the right number in the right position and at the right time (Adryanto, 2014).

Of course, concrete steps are needed to overcome the problem of the Directorate General of Defense in order to fulfill the list of personnel by getting employees with an adequate number and competence. Where it uses another human resource management strategy, namely the employee transfer system, because this policy is not only protected by regulations with the existence of the Minister of Defense Regulation Number 17 of 2019 concerning the management of civil servants of the Ministry of Defense, the Telegram Letter of the Commander of the TNI No. ST/902/2020 and No. ST/62/2020 concerning personnel transfers. The policy on employee transfers in each organization must also have a fair transfer policy and the executive must be responsible for making the transfer by setting predetermined prerequisites, and can show that the transfer is carried out based on the competencies and skills of the employees (Sarma, 2009). Criteria must also be met where they must be in accordance with the needs of the organization, based on the performance, competence and potential of employees, employee transfers must also be carried out in a fair, transparent and objective manner. (Armstrong, 2012).

Employee transfer is also a quick and concrete step to get suitable and adequate employees when carried out with a merit system (Hasibuan, 2016). Correct procedures will be useful in meeting the needs of manpower in sections or units that are short of manpower without recruiting from outside, and personnel have higher motivation and job satisfaction, thanks to the new challenges and situations faced (Simamora, 2006), although there is still an element of political content when employee transfers are carried out (Cyan & Pasha, 2017). due to systemic patronage adhesion (Blunt et al., 2012).

Many employee transfers have been made. Several studies on employee transfers have also been conducted in various countries such as the United States (Prince, 2005; (Campion et al., 2022; Prince, 2005), Japan (Brunello, 1988), India (Satpathy et al., 2012), Pakistan (Cyan & Pasha, 2017), Slovenia (Hajnic & Boshkoska, 2021), Hong Kong (Chan, 1996). and even in Indonesia itself (Budiman, 2018). In addition, most of the employee transfer research is mostly associated with reducing stress levels and family reasons (Budiman, 2018; (E. D. Campion et al., 2022), company problems with the economy (Brunello, 1988), and comparison with external recruitment (Chan, 1996), while transfer research related to competencies specifically in the public sector has not been widely carried out, in addition to the employee transfer system carried out by the

Directorate General of Strength has a unique employee character where there are two types of employees, namely from ASN and TNI (land, sea, and air) in one organization.

This research needs to be carried out because it will provide information about how the employee transfer system can be used to find and get people who have adequate competence. In addition, the findings of this study can be a source of input for other research in the future, the results can also be used by the private sector and the public sector in obtaining employees according to the organization's wants, especially those who have the uniqueness of similar or similar employees. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to explore the transfer of employees who have been running in fulfilling adequate competencies at the Directorate General of Strength.

Research Methods

The research conducted by the researcher uses a qualitative method through a post positivism approach. This is done so that the researcher can get a broader and deeper picture of the employee transfer system at the Directorate General of Strength so that the advantages and disadvantages of the transfer system carried out by the Directorate General of Strength can be analyzed so that input can be given in the future so that it can be perfected in accordance with existing theories. The research was carried out for 30 days from November 2023 to December 2023.

The research instrument was carried out using literature studies related to transfer activities at the Directorate General of Strength and interviews with people who are competent in handling the transfer of employees within the Directorate General of Strength. In order to get more detailed and comprehensive information, the researcher also interviewed the Jab Bag Karpeg Subdivision of the Personnel Bureau, the Ministry of Defense assessor team. The researcher also gave a questionnaire to the sub-directorate of tempat where the results of the transfer of employees who have been and are being placed are placed.

The research interviewed employees in the minpeg subdivision because they knew the direct flow of transfer activities at the Directorate General of Strength. Because this employee transfer system involves the personnel bureau administratively, the researcher also interviews employees from the subdivision of the jab bag karpeg of the Ministry of Defense's personnel bureau, the position subdivision is the person who directly handles personnel transfers or transfers at the Ministry of Defense. The researcher also interviewed the assessor team at the Ministry of Defense as a team that provides assessments or examiners for people who will be placed to work units, and finally we also gave a questionnaire to the sub-directorates at the Directorate General of Strength who have been or are getting personnel as a result of employee transfers carried out to strengthen the results obtained.

The collected data were analyzed through thematic analysis, enabling the identification of recurring patterns, themes, and insights across the interview transcripts and questionnaire responses. This approach ensured a structured interpretation of qualitative data while maintaining flexibility for emerging themes. For questionnaire data,

descriptive statistical analysis was employed to summarize responses and identify trends. These analyses were performed using qualitative coding software and statistical tools to enhance accuracy and reliability.

Results and Discussion

The results of the analysis of interviews and document reviews revealed several important findings related to the employee transfer process at the Directorate General of Defense Strength. First, there is no selection based on the merit system, there is only administrative filing, this shows that the principle of meritocracy has not been applied optimally in the employee transfer process. In fact, the principle of meritocracy is important to ensure that transferred employees have competencies and performance that are in accordance with the needs of their new positions (Perry & Wise, 1990; (Kim & Choi, 2017; Rahayu, 2015). In addition, the existence of a merit-based selection process is also very important to prevent the placement of incompetent individuals in roles where they may have difficulty meeting the demands of the job (Steed et al., 2021) which can ultimately improve organizational efficiency (Ismail, 2019).

Second, there is an element of "spoiler" in the transfer process, where the personal "closeness" between the transferred employee and the authorities affects the transfer decision, highlighting the lack of transparency and accountability in HR management, especially in employee transfers. This practice not only has the potential to cause injustice but can also damage the morale and motivation of other employees who feel that they are not treated fairly (Berman et al., 2019).

The absence of performance appraisals and competency assessments from previous workplaces as a reference in the transfer process shows that transfer decisions are often not based on an objective assessment of employee capabilities and contributions, which has the potential to hinder the development of competencies and optimal employee performance. Whereas competency assessments are crucial during the recruitment process to select competent employees, ensuring that individuals with the necessary skills and qualifications are hired for specific roles (Arifin et al., 2021). Assessments also provide valuable insights into an employee's abilities, skills, and knowledge, which is crucial for matching individuals with appropriate roles and responsibilities (Goh et al., 2024). By evaluating employee competencies, organizations can identify areas that need to be improved and make appropriate decisions regarding training and development initiatives to improve overall performance (Minbaeva, 2005).

In addition, although the Directorate General of Strengthening the Ministry of Defense has conducted orientation for transferred employees, the effectiveness of this orientation needs to be further evaluated to ensure that employees can adapt and contribute optimally in their new positions. This is important because orientation plays an important role in helping new employees integrate into the workplace and align themselves with organizational goals (Mahmood et al., 2023), Mahmood et al (2022) also emphasized that orientation training not only helps new employees to feel part of the organization, but also contributes to increased organizational commitment and job

satisfaction, which is closely related to motivation (Mahmood et al., 2022), where research shows that higher levels of organizational commitment and job satisfaction can lead to greater identification with organizational goals, values, and culture, which ultimately improves employee competence (Yi et al., 2022).

The training and development program managed by the Ministry of Defense Badiklat already exists in line with Riyanto et al. (2021) who emphasized the importance of implementing employee training and development programs effectively to achieve maximum results, but there is no specific training and development program for new employees transferred or transferred as a result, even though it is important for organizations to identify training needs as the first step in developing training programs to improve employee competence (Anam, 2023). In addition, Mahmood et al (2018) suggest that organizations focus on planning and developing training programs to align employees with the organization's vision and mission, which can ultimately improve their competence.

Lastly, there are regulatory and budget constraints that hinder the implementation of feedback is also an important issue that needs to be addressed, considering that effective feedback is an integral part of employee competency and performance development (DeNisi & Murphy, 2017).

With the results of research as mentioned above, leaders at the Directorate General of Strength need to implement selection stages that use competency-based assessments to get qualified people (Sim et al., 2004), whether it is using CAT (Albariu & Amalia, 2022) or other systems that can be relied on as a *decision support* platform(DS) (Hajnic & Boshkoska, 2021). Leaders at the Directorate General of Strength also need to supervise the implementation of selection during employee transfers.

This research has limitations where the research is carried out only covering the units of the directorate of defense forces which are part of the Ministry of Defense, the research samples taken are also only from people who are directly involved with the transfer of employees at the Directorate General of Strength. The samples and locations used are only limited to the environment in the Personnel Bureau and the Directorate General of Strength. The obstacle in this study is that during the in-depth interview, there are still some things that are not conveyed because there is still "confidentiality" data because it concerns the issue of state defense.

This research is very useful for the organization of the Directorate General of Strength in making the right decisions in a good employee transfer process so that it can be a solution to the problems that exist at the Directorate General of Strength, namely getting adequate personnel as needed. Because this employee transfer process is carried out at any time every year and is carried out by many organizations so that it can be an input for any organization as decision-making in human resource management strategies in general and employee transfers in particular, both by private and public organizations.

Conclusion

This study has revealed several important findings regarding the employee transfer process at the Directorate General of Strengthening the Ministry of Defense, with a focus on the implementation of the merit system, transparency, and employee competency development. The results of the analysis show that the employee transfer process still relies heavily on administrative filings without merit-based selection, and there is an element of "spoiler" that shows a lack of transparency and accountability. Performance and competency assessments from previous workplaces are not used as a reference in the transfer process, which has the potential to hinder the development of competencies and optimal performance of employees. In addition, even though orientation and training programs have been carried out by the Ministry of Defense's Badiklat, its effectiveness still needs to be improved. Existing performance evaluations indicate the need for quality improvement, and regulatory and budgetary constraints hinder the effective implementation of feedback. These findings emphasize the importance of reforms in human resource management in the public sector to optimize employee competence and performance.

Bibliography

- Ahdiyana, M. (2015). Moratorium Rekrutmen CPNS dalam Kerangka Reformasi Birokrasi. *Efisiensi - Kajian Ilmu Administrasi*, 11(2). <https://doi.org/10.21831/efisiensi.v11i2.3988>
- Ahuja, I. P. S., & Khamba, J. S. (2008). Total productive maintenance: literature review and directions. *International Journal of Quality & Reliability Management*, 25(7), 709–756.
- Albariu, R. F., & Amalia, R. (2022). The Effectiveness Of The Computer Assisted Test (Cat) System In The Selection of Candidates For Civil Servants In Baubau City, Southeast Sulawesi Province, Indonesia. *Jurnal MSDA (Manajemen Sumber Daya Aparatur)*, 10(1), 104–122. <https://doi.org/10.33701/jmsda.v10i1.2481>
- Arifin, M. A., Azizan, F. L., & Shahidan, A. N. (2021). A Needs Study Toward Developing Ma-TVETTCM Instrument to Measure TVET Teacher Competencies. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 11(6). <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v11-i6/10104>
- Bach, S. (2009). *Managing Human Resources: Personnel Management in Transition*. Blackwell Publishing.
- Berman, E. M., Bowman, J. S., & West, J. P. (2019). *Human Resource Management in Public Service: Paradoxes, Processes, and Problems*. Sage Publications.
- Blunt, P., Turner, M., & Lindroth, H. (2012). Patronage's Progress In Post-Soeharto Indonesia. *Public Administration and Development*, 32(1), 64–81. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pad.617>

- Brunello, G. (1988). Transfers of Employees Between Japanese Manufacturing Enterprises: Some Results from an Enquiry on a Small Sample of Large Firms. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 26(1).
- Campion, E. D., Campion, M. A., & Campion, M. C. (2022). A human capital-based framework of career, well-being, and social information reasons for managerial lateral job assignment preferences. *Human Resource Management*, 61(4), 423–447. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrm.22096>
- Campion, M. A., Fink, A. A., Ruggeberg, B. J., Carr, L., Phillips, G. M., & Odman, R. B. (2011). Doing Competence Well: Best Practices in Competency Modeling in. *Personnel Psychology*, 64(1), 225–262. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-6570.2010.01207.x>
- Chan, W. (1996). External Recruitment versus Internal Promotion. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 14(4), 555–570.
- CNBC. (2022). BKN: Banyak PNS Lulusan S1 & S2 Tapi Kompetensinya Rendah. *CNBC Indonesia*. <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20220722180223-4-357861/bkn-banyak-pns-lulusan-s1-s2-tapi-kompetensinya-rendah>
- Cyan, M. R., & Pasha, O. (2017). A symbiosis of civil service and politics in transfers: The case of Pakistan's management cadres. *Public Administration*, 95(4), 1077–1091. <https://doi.org/10.1111/padm.12355>
- DeNisi, A. S., & Murphy, K. R. (2017). Performance appraisal and performance management: 100 years of progress? *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 102(3), 421–433. <https://doi.org/10.1037/apl0000085>
- Dharmaningtias, D. S. (2016). Implikasi moratorium penerimaan cpns terhadap optimalisasi reformasi birokrasi. *Jurnal Politika Dinamika Masalah Politik Dalam Negeri Dan Hubungan Internasional*, 2(2).
- Flannery, T. P., Hofrichter, D., & Platten, P. E. (1996). *People, pay and performance*. The Free Press.
- Goh, J., Sentoso, A., & Setyawan, A. (2024). The Influence of Work Environment and Employee Competency on Employee Performance Mediated by Motivation. *BALANCE: Economic, Business, Management and Accounting Journal*, 21(1), 33–48. <https://doi.org/10.30651/blc.v21i1.20393>
- Hajnic, M., & Boshkoska, B. M. (2021). A Disruptive Decision Support Platform for Reengineering the Strategic Transfer of Employees. *IEEE Access*, 9, 29921–29928. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2021.3059895>
- Hasibuan, M. S. (2016). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Edisi Revisi). Bumi Aksara.
- Ismail, N. (2019). Merit System Dalam Mewujudkan Transparansi Pembinaan Karier Aparatur Sipil Negara. *Al-Adl: Jurnal Hukum*, 11(1), 33. <https://doi.org/10.31602/al-adl.v11i1.2023>

- Johnson, B. A. M., Cogburn, J. D., & Llorens, J. J. (2022). Artificial Intelligence and Public Human Resource Management: Questions for Research and Practice. *Public Personnel Management*, 51(4), 538–562. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00910260221126498>
- Joo, B.-K., & Lim, T. (2009). The Effects of Organizational Learning Culture, Perceived Job Complexity, and Proactive Personality on Organizational Commitment and Intrinsic Motivation. *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies*, 16(1), 48–60. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1548051809334195>
- Kim, C. H., & Choi, Y. B. (2017). How meritocracy is defined today?: Contemporary aspects of meritocracy. *Economics & Sociology*, 10(1), 112.
- Mahmood, M., Ostrovskiy, A., & Capar, N. (2023). Effect of orientation training on employee and firm performance. *Global Business and Organizational Excellence*, 42(4), 49–62. <https://doi.org/10.1002/joe.22173>
- Mahmood, R., Hee, O. C., Yin, O. S., & Hamli, M. S. H. (2018). The Mediating Effects of Employee Competency on the Relationship between Training Functions and Employee Performance. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(7). <https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v8-i7/4410>
- Minbaeva, D. B. (2005). HRM practices and MNC knowledge transfer. *Personnel Review*, 34(1), 125–144.
- Prasojo, E. (2010). Reformasi kepegawaian Indonesia: Sebuah review dan kritik. *Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen PNS*, 4(1).
- Prince, J. B. (2005). Career-focused employee transfer processes. *Career Development International*, 10(4), 293–309. <https://doi.org/10.1108/13620430510609136>
- Rahayu, S. (2015). Mutasi sebagai Upaya Penempatan Pegawai Secara The Right Man on The Right Place. *Efisiensi - Kajian Ilmu Administrasi*, 3(2). <https://doi.org/10.21831/efisiensi.v3i2.3795>
- Rakhmawanto, A. (2011). Kebijakan Moratorium dan Penataan Pegawai Negeri Sipil Bagian dari Reformasi Birokrasi. *Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen PNS*, 5(2 November), 12.
- Rao, P. S. (2009). *Personnel and human resource management*. Himalaya Publishing House Girgaon.
- Sarma, A. M. (2009). *Personnel and human resource management*. Himalaya Publishing House.
- Satpathy, I., Patnaik, B., & Goyal, S. (2012). Versatility Internal Transfers (VIT) are tool for productivity and retention: An inside story (With special reference to selected banking organisation in Bhubaneswar, Odisha). *Asian Journal of Multidimensional Research (AJMR)*, 1(1), 1–10.

- Siguaw, J. A., Simpson, P. M., & Enz, C. A. (2006). Conceptualizing Innovation Orientation: A Framework for Study and Integration of Innovation Research. *Journal of Product Innovation Management*, 23(6), 556–574. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5885.2006.00224.x>
- Sim, G., Holifield, P., & Brown, M. (2004). Implementation of computer assisted assessment: lessons from the literature. *ALT-J*, 12(3), 215–229. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0968776042000259546>
- Simamora, H. (2006). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia: Vol. Cetakan kedua* (edisi ketiga). Penerbit: YKPN.
- Soderquist, K. E., Papalexandris, A., Ioannou, G., & Prastacos, G. (2010). From task-based to competency-based. *Personnel Review*, 39(3), 325–346. <https://doi.org/10.1108/00483481011030520>
- Steed, K., De Nobile, J., & Waniganayake, M. (2021). Promotion to leadership, not just merit, but insider knowledge: What do school principals say? *Journal of Educational Leadership, Policy and Practice*, 36(1), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.21307/jelpp-2021-001>
- Sumanti, R. (2018). Pengembangan Kompetensi Pegawai Negeri Sipil (PNS) di Daerah Tantangan dan Peluang. *Jurnal Transformasi Administrasi*, 8(2), 115–129.
- Tempo.co. (2010, December 30). Kemenhan Terapkan Zero Growth Policy untuk Personel . *Tempo.Co*. <https://nasional.tempo.co/read/302842/kemenhan-terapkan-zero-growth-policy-untuk-personel>
- Tjiptoherijanto, P. (2011). Reformasi Perencanaan Kepegawaian. *Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen PNS*, 5(2).
- Yi, M., Jiang, D., Wang, J., Zhang, Z., Jia, Y., Zhao, B., Guo, L., & Chen, O. (2022). Relationships among thriving at work, organisational commitment and job satisfaction among Chinese front-line primary public health workers during COVID-19 pandemic: a structural equation model analysis. *BMJ Open*, 12(6), e059032. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2021-059032>